



MEETING MINUTES

Chief's Advisory Committee (In-Person)

Tuesday, July 27, 2021 – 5200 Emerald Parkway

Welcome to Committee by Chief Páez

Chief Páez welcomed the committee. Thanked all for coming together in-person and being available online over the past 10 months. He turned the meeting over to Chair and Co-Chair Judge Maynard and Ms. Ajmeri Hoque.

Dwayne Maynard welcomed all to the meeting and thanked them for being a part of the first in-person CAC meeting. He thanked all for their time and efforts thus far as the CAC continues building bridges with the police department and the diverse community groups.

Committee members present: W. Dwayne Maynard, Ajmeri Hoque, Imran Malik, Cameron Justice, Sri Gaddam, Isao Shoji, Yanling Yin; Police Department members present: Chief Justin Páez, Lt. Nick Tabernik, Lt. Lattanzi, Cpl. Devin Howard, Jay Somerville, and PIO Rebecca Myers
Minutes by: Becky Metcalf

Committee Business

- **Attendance**

Chief Páez called roll for the meeting:

Judge Dwayne Maynard - present

Ajmeri Hoque – present

Sri Gaddam – present

Yanling Yin – present

Cameron Justice – present

Imran Malik – present

Isao Shoji – present

Susan Ortega – not present

Cortney Ingram – not present

Stella Villalba – not present

- **Review/Amend/Adopt Last Meeting's Minutes**

Previously posted minutes from the May 25, 2021 meeting had been reviewed by all and there were no amendments needed. Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to accept the minutes from May 25, 2021 CAC meeting. Ajmeri Hoque motioned to accept the minutes and Imran Malik seconded the motion. All were in favor of accepting the May 25, 2021 minutes; the minutes are accepted. Minutes from the June 24, 2021 were previously sent out by email and hard copies distributed to the CAC members for review at the meeting. Dwayne Maynard had one correction in wording on Page 9. There was no further discussion or corrections requested by members of the CAC. Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to accept the minutes from the June 24, 2021 CAC meeting as amended. Ajmeri Hoque motioned to accept the minutes and Imran Malik

seconded the motion. All were in favor of accepting the June 24, 2021 CAC minutes as amended; the minutes are accepted.

Old Business

Dwayne Maynard asked Rebecca Myers and the CAC members who were present if there was any old business to address. CAC members present did not have any old business to address. Dwayne Maynard asked Chief Páez to move into the Chief's Updates and provide information about the SRO contract.

Chief's Update to Committee

Chief Páez advised that the police department presented the SRO contract to City Council at their meeting on Monday July 26, 2021.

Lt. Tabernik reviewed the SRO contract, which has been in place for 23 years but is updated on an annual basis. The School Board voted 5-0 to accept the contract at their most recent school board meeting and City Council voted 7-0 to accept the contract at the July 26 council meeting. There are two additional schools opening this year in the school district; one is in the Union County Sheriff's Office (UCSO) jurisdiction and will be staffed by a UCSO Deputy. Dublin Police Department will be meeting with them to ensure connectivity between the two jurisdictions.

Ajmeri Hoque asked about the difference between the SRO Contract and the FOP contract; how does the FOP contract affect the SRO contract. Chief Páez explained that the FOP contract is an agreement between the City of Dublin and the FOP Lodge 9 and is for all Dublin Police Officers in the department. The FOP contract has been in negotiation for a couple of years now; delayed in part by the pandemic. The FOP Contract does not affect the SRO Contract and is specifically for the officers assigned as SRO's in the schools.

Cpl. Howard provided further information about the FOP Contract. He advised they had been meeting with the city bargaining over wages and insurance. Members want to keep costs low for the employee and the city has to balance the rising costs of insurance. The contract went to "fact finding", where an independent entity reviews all of the information then delivers a recommendation. City Council approved the fact-finding report, which then goes to the members (officers) for a vote where they can accept or decline the report. Officers rejected the fact-finding report, as they were not satisfied with the findings.

Dwayne Maynard commented about the recent contract for Columbus Police Department a portion of which equated to a 14% pay raise. He asked if there were any other questions about the SRO contract. There were no questions from the CAC and no further discussion.

Sri Gaddam offered comments about how insurance works in his company. Chief Páez advised the City of Dublin is self-insured and managed by United HealthCare. Employees have an HSA, which is funded partially by the city; expenses are continually reviewed to determine how to keep costs low for our employees.

Dwayne Maynard moved on to the next item of discussion, the Dublin Life article, and deferred to Rebecca Myers for an update. Rebecca had the opportunity to review all the quotes provided so far by the CAC members. Once all quotes have been received, the information will be published on the City website. The actual print copy of the Dublin Life magazine comes out the first part

of August. Rebecca thanked all for their assistance with this project. Sri Gaddam advised that he would have his quote to Rebecca by the end of the week. Yanling Yin thanked Rebecca for her work on this project.

Rebecca Myers reviewed the new CAC Microsoft Teams portal with the group. Dwayne Maynard commented that it would be helpful to have the information organized in the Teams portal by meeting date to include all associated documents. Imran Malik asked about training or tutorials on use of the Teams portal. Ajmeri Hoque advised that YouTube is a great place to go for tutorials as well.

Lt. Lattanzi provided follow-up on the body worn camera program. He advised that based on previous discussions with the CAC, changes have been made to our policy (503.03) to better reflect how we are operating. The document presented had those changes highlighted in yellow for review with the committee. All officers in the Dublin Police Department are now equipped with a body worn camera. All uniformed officers are required to wear their body worn camera when working. Additional language was added in reference to officer's working in "plain clothes" and when they should be wearing the body worn camera. A trimesterly review process was added to the policy and minor changes were made to language related to activation to make clear our intentions. This includes, but is not limited to, enforcement and investigative contacts with the public where the camera shall be activated: traffic stops; stranded motorists; incidents where forced entry is made; search warrants executed on a business, residence, or structure; in-person arrest warrant service; any self-initiated citizen contact that would normally generate a call for service. The section of policy related to deactivation included language to clearly identify when the body camera is turned off. Documented review - at a minimum every employee will have at least one documented review on a trimesterly basis, which should focus on certain incident types: arrests, domestic violence, assaults, traffic stops, search warrants/arrest warrant execution. If the officer has no recorded body camera video a supervisor shall conduct an operability function test. The reviews or function test shall be documented in a memo to the respective bureau commander and included as part of the Early Warning System (EWS) trimesterly review.

Imran Malik asked if the review is conducted by a supervisor or a third party. Lt. Lattanzi advised it would be that employee's direct supervisor. Imran Malik also asked if there is a reason why the review is conducted trimesterly. Chief Páez advised that previously the department did not have a review process outlined in the policy so it was added. The supervisors, in practice, were doing this review but it was not written in the policy.

Sri Gaddam asked how many hours of training employees receive on use of the body worn cameras. Chief Páez advised there is training that is provided from the company.

Dwayne Maynard asked the group if there were any additional or outstanding questions from the group regarding body worn cameras. There were no questions at that time from the group.

Cpl. Howard shared, using his body worn camera, a quick review of how they work and how easy they are to operate. Sri Gaddam asked how many hours of video the department has recorded. Chief Páez advised it is an astronomical number and it is not all related to cases, this is why we provide some structure in our policy to guide the supervisor in what to look for when reviewing body camera footage for their officers. Ajmeri Hoque commented that the department also gets requests from attorneys who review as well. Additionally, Cpl. Howard advised the footage is

good for evaluating employees as well. You can look for areas of improvement and see how officers are interacting with the public.

Yanling Yin thanked Cpl. Howard for showing the group how easy it was to use the cameras but wondered how the officer knows it is still on or functioning. Cpl. Howard advised that every couple of minutes the camera vibrates so you know it is on. The cameras have a lookback feature the goes back 60 seconds, it is continually recording but not saving. They cannot be accidentally turned off because of a two-press power off feature.

Yanling Yin asked how often the SRO's activate their cameras. Lt. Tabernik advised that all of the SRO's have cameras and that they follow the same categorical activation policy. The SRO's would also follow the same trimesterly review process. If they have no body camera footage for review they would have to perform the function check as outlined in policy.

Dwayne Maynard asked who took part in the edit of the policy. Chief Páez advised the review was initially discussed by command staff, then presented and discussed during our management staff meeting. The policy was also reviewed and discussed with the FOP.

Dwayne Maynard asked what is the police department's management structure. Chief Páez shared the levels of police management structure as follows: Chief, Lieutenant, Sergeant, and Corporal. Dwayne Maynard commented that this policy is a good thing to point to demonstrating proactive engagement with the community which has lead us to this point. The checklist helps officers and the public to understand how the body cameras are used and builds a degree of trust from the community that the department has reviewed their policy and has come up with these guidelines.

Additionally, Lt. Lattanzi advised that over the past couple of months the department has done some active testing with the body cameras. They have been struggling with battery life issues, as the current devices do not have an external battery component. When the officer docks the camera at the police department, it charges the battery and downloads the video. The docks in the cruisers are not used as it adds the opportunity for an officer to forget to put their camera back on their uniform. The department ran tests on cameras with different settings to test battery life. Two functions that were reviewed: 1) record after the fact; and 2) look back function. The record after the fact function records an event even if you did not activate the camera; it was discovered that feature was draining the battery life of the cameras. The department has only tried to use the record after the fact function on one occasion. The capability still exists with our cruiser cameras but that functionality has been turned off on the body cameras. In conjunction with turning that off, the look back function was extended from 30 seconds to 60 seconds.

Isao Shoji asked what type of cameras they are and how old they are. Chief advised the cameras are from WatchGuard and were purchased in 2018. Ajmeri Hoque asked about the life expectancy of the cameras. Lt. Lattanzi advised that the department builds in funds for replacement into the city's five-year capital improvements plan. The current body cameras have about three more years of life expectancy. Ajmeri Hoque asked what made the department decide on WatchGuard. Lt. Lattanzi advised that their cameras provided the greatest capability; the department also tried Axon cameras but WatchGuard provided better functionality.

Chief Páez advised that we were among the first few departments tackling this; the department was fortunate to have contact with an employee from the city's IT Department that left Dublin and took a position with CPD heading up their body camera program. WatchGuard has recently been bought out by Motorola; the future of body cameras with WatchGuard is interchangeable batteries like we have with police radios but in the meantime we have to ensure officers are able to record with their body camera over their entire shift. The expectation from public is that if an incident occurs, there should be body camera footage.

Imran Malik asked about the range of the cruiser camera, how far you can see on the video. Lt. Lattanzi advised the cameras have a wide angle feature; it reaches about 45 degrees from side mirror to side mirror and that the closer to the camera the more condensed the video will get. There are also cameras inside the car that record the detainee area of the cruiser. Imran Malik asked what is the distance you can see on the outside camera. Lt. Lattanzi did not have an exact distance but gave an example to consider; a traffic stop distance at about 30ft behind the vehicle and you can clearly see. Ajmeri Hoque advised that videos she has seen are very clear and that you can see very far out and pretty far along the sides as well.

Brief break at 7:00 for group photo.

Dwayne Maynard asked to move the agenda item related to officer line of duty death/officer wellness to another meeting. All agreed.

Aspirational Goals Discussion

Chief Páez advised that he, Dwayne Maynard, Ajmeri Hoque and Rebecca Myers met virtually to discuss the aspirational goals. He should know more after a meeting later this week on the date the CTF plans to present their report and he will provide that information as soon as possible. Chief Páez and Rebecca Myers have some time set aside to review the draft and will send out to the group upon completion. Barring any sort of change, Chief Páez believes 8/16 is the date the CTF will present their report but should know for sure later this week. Dwayne Maynard asked if they would have additional discussion, to include Isao Shoji, prior to the final revision, preferably in a virtual meeting. Chief Páez will schedule a virtual meeting to review the revised goals document prior to the final submission. Dwayne Maynard also asked to be advised if they need to attend in person at the August 16th council meeting. He also suggested to the CAC members, that after the revised document is presented to the group, it would be good for all members to communicate any additional ideas or comments via the email thread or by phone if preferred between now and the 16th.

New Business

Dwayne Maynard asked if anyone had any current events they would like to discuss. Ajmeri Hoque asked about the fire that occurred yesterday at Bridge Park. Chief Páez advised that during the council meeting on 8/16 they got word of a building on fire at Bridge Park (Urban Myer Pint House rooftop). There were no injuries, the building was quickly evacuated, and the fire contained. Detectives and the fire department are still investigating but initially it does not appear that it was intentional. Ajmeri Hoque commented that the updates from police and fire that were sent out on social media were fantastic.

Cameron Justice advised the group that the Irish Festival is an awesome opportunity to connect with the community. Lt. Tabernik advised that due to COVID, this year the festival is scaled back and being called Dublin Irish Days. The CLO's and SRO's will be staffing the Identikid tables; these are normally staffed by Community Service Officers. Additionally, the venue is not only going to be held at the Coffman Park site but has been extended to the Historic Dublin and Bridge Park areas.

Imran Malik advised that he had the opportunity to tour the new city council chambers. He advised they have conference rooms there and suggested using one of those rooms in the future for CAC meetings. Chief Páez advised that we hope to have meetings over there in the future. Imran Malik commented that it is a beautiful facility.

Dwayne asked for an update on the CTF and what their presentation is going to look like from Isao Shoji. Isao Shoji advised there was quite a bit of discussion and last minute changes being made; they all landed at a place where they were all comfortable. The remaining work will be done by the chair and vice chair who were very appreciative of what the CAC offered.

Chief Páez advised that Kirby Dearth, from the City Manager's Office, has been largely in charge of the task force report. Chief will ask for an update and will share that information with the group. Rebecca Myers assured all get a copy when it is available. Dwayne asked if the CTF will be making any changes to what the CAC has submitted and if that is within their prevue to do. Chief Páez advised that yes it is in their prevue. Rebecca Myers said that Kirby mentioned a few changes to the overall plan but not to the CAC section.

Imran Malik offered a "shout out" to the department on July 4th festivities. Comments from community members specifically about the parade were positive; manageability and traffic control was good and cleared up within 45 minutes.

Lt. Tabernik presented some information regarding responding to civil disturbance and special events. The Ohio Collaborative has recently given guidance on responding to civil disturbance; he shared that information with the CAC and reviewed Dublin's policy. Some highlights from the presentation are included below:

Dublin Police Policy:

- Goals: Preserve peace, protect life and property, objectively protect First Amendment rights (to assemble and voice opinions)
- Training: For new officers and annually for all officers; focused on using protective gear, having proficiency in weapons and less-lethal weapons, understanding crowd movements and response; joint trainings with other jurisdictions
- Specialized equipment: Protective uniform includes officer name and badge; helmet and face shield; gas mask
- Less-lethal weapons: OC spray, TASER, specialty impact munitions (SIMS) preserve peace, protect life and property objectively protect

Dwayne Maynard asked if the CAC could be helpful with developing lines of communication in these types of instances. Lt. Tabernik advised yes that would be very helpful. Dwayne Maynard advised to keep this in mind as community partners to build the bridge back from the community to the police department.

Dublin Police Procedures:

- Steps: Strategic planning and implementation
- Planned demonstrations: Once demonstration is identified, management and planning is assigned to a bureau commander; contact demonstration organizers for connectivity and communication; formulate incident safety plan; vet information; dispersal planning
- Spontaneous demonstrations and civil disturbances: Similar planning; communicate with demonstrating group; establish contact with group leaders to assess intentions and motivations; develop mutually acceptable plan for de-escalation and disbursal

Lt. Tabernik provided an example of an Action Plan Booklet showing all things that are considered in preparation and deployment.

Ajmeri Hoque asked at what point you contact other departments for assistance. Lt. Tabernik advised that the department has open lines of communication with other jurisdictions and for instance, have trained with specialized officers from Ohio State Highway Patrol and can call on those jurisdictions where needed. Ajmeri Hoque asked how you determine the number of officers needed. Lt. Tabernik explained that is where communication with organizers prior to an event is vitally important; you can reach out and ask how many people they expect. The department can then gauge how many officers to deploy. Ajmeri Hoque asked if there were pictures of the gear an officer might use. Lt. Tabernik and Chief Páez advised they would bring some equipment to a meeting for CAC members to view. Lt. Tabernik asked if there were any other questions from the group. There were no other questions regarding responding to civil disturbances.

Special Events:

- Primary goal is to provide a safe and enjoyable experience for residents and visitors.
- Examples: the Memorial Tournament; Independence Day Celebration Dublin Irish Festival
- Interagency coordination and planning
- Public communications

Lt. Tabernik reviewed an action plan booklet with the group.

Yanling Yin asked how long in advance you start planning. Lt. Lattanzi advised that for example, planning for the Memorial Tournament begins in February.

Lt. Tabernik advised that if anyone had questions at any time, feel free to contact him.

Imran Malik asked whom do we tap into for additional resources. Chief Páez advised that it depends on the incident to help determine what resources are needed. Lt. Tabernik advised that for some larger events if we need more officers we have great partners outside our community.

Public Commentary

Dwayne Maynard asked Rebecca Myers if there was any public commentary. Rebecca Myers advised there was none.

Future Meetings

Dwayne Maynard that the next meeting is supposed to be our last as the first iteration of the CAC. His thinking is that maybe for the last meeting, that the CAC does not focus so much on

reports and information sharing from the department but maybe have more of a roundtable discussion about what the CAC has done and what they think the direction or focus of the next iteration of the CAC should be. How does that group build on what has been done and take the committee forward. He feels it would be helpful to have a conversation of what the current CAC members think and possibly invite others who may be considering being a part of this group to the next meeting. He hopes it will be less formal and just a roundtable conversation. He has been thinking about what those initial concepts and terminology look like to the CAC members now.

Chief Páez is hopeful that all can make the meeting and have the opportunity to get together and share information; it is a good opportunity to talk about what happens next.

Imran Malik asked if there a policy in place governing the CAC meetings or if the meetings can be more inclusive. Chief Páez advised that these are public meetings and all are welcome to attend; just need to work on some additional advertising and getting that information out to the community. Ajmeri Hoque suggested for future meetings, where the public may attend, maybe putting public commentary toward the beginning so they would not have to stay for the entire meeting if they prefer not to.

Dwayne Maynard asked if there was anyone had anything else to add. There was no other commentary from the group. Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to adjourn. Ajmeri Hoque motioned to adjourn and Isao Shoji seconded the motion. All were in favor and the meeting was officially adjourned at 8:15 PM.

Dublin Police Department - Contact Information
614-410-4800

Chief Justin Páez
jpaez@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Greg Lattanzi
glattanzi@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Nick Tabernik
ntabernik@dublin.oh.us

Director Jay Somerville
jsomerville@dublin.oh.us

Corporal Devin Howard
dhoward@dublin.oh.us

Officer Amber McCloskey
amccloskey@dublin.oh.us